

Navigation Committee

Agenda 31 October 2019

2.00pm

Dockyard, Griffin Lane, Norwich, NR7 0SL

Introduction

1. To receive apologies for absence
2. To receive declarations of interest
3. To note whether any items have been proposed as matters of urgent business
4. Public question time – to note whether any questions have been raised by members of the public
5. **To receive and confirm the minutes of the Navigation Committee meeting held on 5 September 2019** (Pages 3-11)
6. **Summary of actions and outstanding issues following discussion at previous meetings** (Pages 12-13)

Reports for information

7. **Chief Executive's report and current issues** (Pages 14-21)
Report by Chief Executive
8. **Proposed navigation charges for 2020/21 in the navigation area and adjacent waters** (Pages 22-30)
Report by Chief Executive, Chief Financial Officer, and Head of IT and Collector of Tolls
9. **Construction, maintenance, and environment work programme: progress update** (Pages 31-35)
Report by Head of Construction, Maintenance, and Environment

Other matters

10. To note the date of the next meeting – **Thursday 16 January 2020 at 2.00pm at the Dockyard, Griffin Lane, Norwich**
11. Exclusion of the public
The Authority is asked to consider exclusion of the public from the meeting under Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972 for the consideration of the item below on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined by

Paragraphs 1 and 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A to the Act as amended, and that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public benefit in disclosing the information.

12. **To receive the Exempt Minutes from the meeting held on 5 September 2019** (Pages 36-37)

Navigation Committee

Minutes of the meeting held on 05 September 2019

1.	To receive apologies for absence	2
	Welcome	2
	Recordings	2
2.	To receive declarations of interest	2
3.	To note whether and items have been proposed as matters of urgent business	2
4.	Public question time	2
5.	Minutes of Navigation Committee meeting held on 13 June 2019	2
6.	Summary of actions and outstanding issues following discussions at previous meetings	2
7.	Chief Executive's report and current issues	3
8.	Navigation income and expenditure: 1 April to 30 June 2019 actual and 2019/20 forecast outturn	3
9.	Review of Barnes Brinkcraft	4
10.	Safety by the Water guide (draft)	4
11.	Insurance audit 2020	5
12.	Consultation: Implementation of CJEU judgment on diesel fuel used in private pleasure craft	6
13.	Air pollutant emissions from domestic vessels and inland waterways	6
14.	Construction, maintenance and environment work programme progress update	7
15.	Date of next meeting	7
16.	Exclusion of the public	7
17.	Exempt minutes of Navigation Committee meeting held on 13 June 2019	7
18.	Review of launch billets	7
	Appendix 1	9
	Declaration of interests Navigation Committee, 05 September 2019	9

Present

Nicky Talbot – in the Chair, Kelvin Allen, John Ash, Linda Aspland, Mike Barnes, Harry Blathwayt, Matthew Bradbury, Greg Munford, Simon Sparrow, Alan Thomson.

In attendance

Steve Birtles – Head of Safety Management, Natalie Beal – Planning Policy Officer (item 10), Sarah Mullarney - Administrative Officer, John Packman - Chief Executive, Rob Rogers - Director of Operations.

1. To receive apologies for absence

Apologies received from Andy Hamilton, Leslie Mogford, and Paul Thomas.

Welcome

The Chair welcomed Harry Blathwayt to his first Navigation Committee meeting.

Recordings

The Chair announced that the meeting would be recorded. The copyright remains with the Authority, but a copy of the recording could be requested from the Governance team.

2. To receive declarations of interest

Members expressed their declarations of interest as set out in Appendix 1 of these minutes.

3. To note whether any items have been proposed as matters of urgent business

No items were proposed as a matter of urgent business.

4. Public question time

No public questions were raised.

5. Minutes of Navigation Committee meeting held on 13 June 2019

The minutes of the meeting held on 13 June 2019 were signed by the Chair as a correct record of the meeting.

6. Summary of actions and outstanding issues following discussions at previous meetings

Members received a report summarising the progress of issues recently presented to the Committee.

The Chief Executive confirmed that the action plan for the Staithes report would be reviewed at the Broads Local Access Forum meeting on 4 December 2019.

One member commended the operation of Somerleyton bridge during a recent visit, particularly the electronic sign indicating the bridge opening times. Members noted that there were still issues with the opening of the bridge on very hot days. The Chief Executive added that Network Rail had announced an upgrade to the signalling next year, which in future would be a computerised system controlled from the Colchester Rail Operating Centre. This would relieve the onsite operatives of this task so they could focus on opening the bridges. Combined with upgrading the detection systems to the contacts on the bridges, this would make the opening of the bridges more reliable and provide a better service to boat owners.

Members noted the report.

7. Chief Executive's report and current issues

Members noted the effort regarding the removal of sunken and abandoned vessels, and the Chief Executive reminded members that the Authority did not have the powers to remove vessels if they were moored on private land.

Members discussed the warnings issued for speed, noticeably in the Wroxham and Upper Bure area. It was explained that the high figures for Wroxham were verbal warnings, for issues such as wash from boats. It was also noted that there was little difference between the number of warnings issued to hire and private vessels, however for serious offences such as care and caution, written warnings were higher for private vessels. The Chief Executive said the data suggested the number of warnings issued had decreased in recent years, attributing this to the electronic speed signs and the public briefings issued by hire boat companies. Members discussed what more could be done to govern the speed of day boats based in Wroxham, including the introduction of electric day boats, advances to GPS and the use of mobile apps.

One member expressed concern with private boats speeding in the boat testing area of the River Yare after dark, and the wash this created. It was confirmed that notice must be given by boatyards before using these areas for boat testing and that they could only be used during daylight hours.

Members noted the report.

8. Navigation income and expenditure: 1 April to 30 June 2019 actual and 2019/20 forecast outturn

The Chief Executive introduced the report on behalf of the Chief Financial Officer and provided members with an update on the latest figures. It was explained that at the end of July the actual income and expenditure compared to the profiled budget had moved to a favourable variance of £145,303 (7.88%). This was due to the toll income being £55,130 above the profiled budget. There had been no changes to the Latest Available Budget, and the reserve balance had dropped to £863,776. The CANAPE claim two was received on 9 August 2019.

Members were given an update on the tolls forecast. It was reported that at the end of August, the tolls income was within 0.067% of the estimate figure. Income from private craft was nearly £9,000 above the predicted total, whereas hire craft was down by £11,000. It was discussed that this was a result of a trend for hire companies building fewer but bigger boats compared to the number retired from their fleets to meet market demand. One member commented that the new boats being built were remaining largely within the system, which would have a positive effect for tolls. The Chief Executive said the total number of boats had been relatively stable over time, but noted the change in fleet composition.

Members discussed the external audit and reiterated their disappointment with the delay. They were made aware that there was a national shortage of auditors and other local authorities were in a similar position.

The Chair commended the Chief Financial Officer and the effort put into producing the figures.

Members noted the report.

9. Review of Barnes Brinkcraft

Members were updated on the operation of the pontoons at the Barnes Brinkcraft site in Hoveton, previously reviewed by the Navigation Committee at the 22 February 2018 meeting. The Director of Operations explained that the Broads Authority had worked collaboratively with the operator to resolve the situation and issues with encroachment. It was reported that the operators were honouring the agreement.

It was noted that Ranger input was still required to monitor moorings. The main time when Ranger input was required to monitor moorings was Sunday, when no one was at the yard during out of hours. Feedback from Broads Tours, operating opposite the site, was that they could manage with the situation.

Members noted the report.

10. Safety by the Water guide (draft)

The Planning Policy Officer explained that the Safety by the Water guide was a compilation of existing advice on how to get out of the water safely. The planning guide had been drafted with input from the Head of Ranger Services, Head of Safety Management, Rivers Engineer, and Planning Officer.

Prior to the Navigation Committee meeting, the guide had been shared with the Boat Safety Management Group. It was reported that the Broads Hire Boat Federation shared concerns about the potential for boats to be damaged by safety ladders, and advised prescribing that ladders should be fitted in a recess. The Planning Policy Officer responded that this was adequately covered in the document and that recessed hand holds could themselves be trip hazards. Members were in favour of the use of recess ladders and recommended that hand rails be set back from the edge. The Planning Policy Officer said some additional text would be

added to the guide to reference this, and that planning applicants would need to consider the use of the waterway near the development when preparing mitigation measures.

Comments from Boat Safety Management Group member John Tibbenham suggested chapters 3,4,5 and 7 were irrelevant and should be removed. He also commented that the guide ignores the Authority's obligation to remove underwater objects. The Planning Policy Officer said that chapters 3 and 4 provide background for those unfamiliar with water safety issues; chapter 5 demonstrates how the guide fits with national policy; and chapter 7 adds information for risk assessing the site. She added that the guide is for the purpose of development; objects that may injure people who fall into the water may not affect navigation, and the Authority's obligation was to remove objects that impact navigation. It was proposed not to change the guide.

Members shared concern with a guide that was too prescriptive and discussed the potential for the Authority to be liable for any accidents. One member said the onus needed to be on the owner of the asset. The Head of Safety Management explained that the document was intended as a guide for best practice that signposts to national guidance. He confirmed that the Royal Society for the Prevention of Accidents and the National Safety Forum had been consulted on the document.

Members suggested that the guide be reviewed by the Broads Authority's solicitor for advice on constructing a disclaimer to appear at the beginning of the document.

The comments of the Navigation Committee will be reported to the Planning Committee. The final guide will be shared with Navigation Committee members for review before it is adopted by the Broads Authority.

11. Insurance audit 2020

The Head of Safety Management gave members an overview of the insurance audit process and proposed that the scheduled audit for 2020 be cancelled. He discussed the value of running another audit, and said it was unlikely that it would produce a different result from the audits conducted in 2015 and 2017, adding that self-declaration proved to be effective.

Members recognised the amount of resources required for the audit, and agreed there was no need to repeat the exercise. The Head of Safety Management confirmed there were safeguarding measures in place to check insurance by other means, including ranger checks and when pursuing Boat Safety Scheme certification.

Members noted the high level of compliance and discussed the risks from the 10% who were not compliant. The Head of Safety Management said the issue was well publicised after the last audit and explained that the tolls team pursue declarations from toll payers. One member expressed concern with the process for collecting declarations from those who paid their toll over the phone. Another member suggested including a self-declaration tick box on the online toll form. The Head of Safety Management agreed to review the processes for declaring insurance.

Members supported the cancellation of the scheduled audit for 2020, with the view that the process could be repeated in the future if there was evidence that boat owners were not complying.

12. Consultation: Implementation of CJEU judgment on diesel fuel used in private pleasure craft

Members were reminded that the deadline for responses to the Government's consultation was 9 September 2019. The Director of Operations acknowledged that members may have responded in a personal capacity but asked for comments to be included in the Broads Authority's response.

One member noted an increase in boat owners using jerry cans to fill their vessels with white diesel, increasing the risk of spillage. The Director of Operations said concerns with safety and pollution had been raised. Members also discussed the issue of supply of white diesel in the Broads.

The views of the Navigation Committee would be incorporated into the Broads Authority's response.

13. Air pollutant emissions from domestic vessels and inland waterways

The Director of Operations explained that the deadline for responses to the Department of Transport's consultation was January 2020. He said the Broads Authority's tolls data provided information on the number of vessels and engine sizes, but members were asked for individual comments to be included in the Authority's response.

One member noted that vessels also pushed water through the exhaust systems and queried how much this filtered out in the way of air pollution. He said the result of water contamination also needed to be considered.

Another member highlighted that a change to electric vessels would require more power supply and electric charging points to be made available, and questioned how this would be funded and where they would be located in the Broads.

A member asked if modern diesel boats had the capability for AdBlue and if they had Diesel Particulate Filter technology. The Director of Operations responded that boats would require modifications for the use of AdBlue and said he would feedback the questions raised by members.

The views of the Navigation Committee would be incorporated into the Broads Authority's response to the consultation.

14. Construction, maintenance and environment work programme progress update

The Director of Operations provided members with an update on the progress of the work programme for the construction, maintenance and environment teams. Members were informed of changes to the teams and the purchase of a new tug to replace the Cannonbrook. He added that the new tug would require some improvements.

Members were reminded that the tree cutting programme was available to view on the Authority's website at [Riverside tree and scrub management](#). The Director of Operations explained that it was a sensitive programme and the maps outlined areas where the team would like to cut, noting the need for landowner permission. He confirmed that the purpose of the tree shears was to improve the tree cutting programme, making it a quicker process, reducing manual handling and protecting staff from musculoskeletal injuries, but not necessarily cutting more.

Members noted the report.

15. Date of next meeting

The next meeting of the Navigation Committee would be held on Thursday 31 October 2019 at the Dockyard, Griffin Lane, Thorpe St Andrew, Norwich, NR7 0SL commencing at 2pm.

16. Exclusion of the public

It was resolved that the public be excluded from the meeting under section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972 for consideration of the item below on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined by Paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A to the Act as amended, and that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public benefit in disclosing the information.

The public left the meeting and the recording was suspended.

17. Exempt minutes of Navigation Committee meeting held on 13 June 2019

The exempt minutes of the meeting held on 13 June 2019 were signed by the Chair as a correct record of the meeting.

18. Review of launch billets

Members were consulted on a review of launch billets at certain locations. Further details would be presented to members at a future meeting.

The Director of Operations gave members an update to the launch replacement programme.

The meeting ended at 15:50.

Signed

Chairman

Appendix 1

Declaration of interests Navigation Committee, 05 September 2019

Member	Agenda/minute	Nature of interest
Kelvin Allen	-	As previous
John Ash	-	As previously notified
Alan Thomson	-	As previously stated
Harry Blathwayt	-	Toll payer
Linda Aspland	-	NBYC, Wroxham resident, BLAF, toll payer
Mike Barnes	12-13	As previous, toll payer, diesel engine in boat
Matthew Bradbury	-	As previously stated
Greg Munford	-	As previously declared
Simon Sparrow	-	As previously declared
Nicky Talbot	12-13	As previous. Toll payer and diesel engine in boat.

Navigation Committee

31 October 2019

Agenda item number 6

Summary of actions and outstanding issues following discussion at previous meetings

Report by Administrative Officer

Title	Meeting date	Lead officer	Summary of actions	Progress so far
Staithe report	20/04/2017	Lewis Treloar	Prof Williamson had been chased for the Staithe report and the Authority hoped to receive the maps by the end of April.	The action plan for the Staithe report will be discussed at the Broads Local Access Forum meeting on 4 December. A copy of the report will be shared with members of the Navigation Committee.

Title	Meeting date	Lead officer	Summary of actions	Progress so far
Network Rail Whole Life Strategy	19/10/2017	John Packman	Network Rail Whole Life Strategy for swing bridges and replacing Trowse Swing Bridge with a fixed bridge.	At a meeting with one of the local Network Rail Managers in October, the need for the display of red flags at the bridges and Christmas and Boxing Day cover was raised. Following consultation with NSBA and other stakeholders, officers have reinforced the importance of retaining the red flags and agreed, based on last year's evidence, that the bridge operators do not need to be on duty on Christmas Day and Boxing Day.
Planning application with navigation implications: BA/2018/0466/FUL – Land at Burgh Castle – BFAP Compartment 34	17/01/2019	Rob Rogers	Lease arrangements and re-piling at Burgh Castle for the reinstatement of free 24 hour moorings.	Following an exempt paper (considered at Navigation Committee and Broads Authority), officers are progressing discussions with a landowner on the alternative Burgh Castle mooring site. A series of options have been presented to him, based upon the recommendations within the exempt report. We await the landowner's response.
Safety by the water guide	05/09/2019	Natalie Beal	Members suggested the draft guide be reviewed by the Authority's solicitor for advice on constructing a disclaimer to appear at the start of the document.	Navigation Committee's comments will be reported to the Planning Committee. The final guide will be shared with Navigation Committee members for review before it is adopted by the Broads Authority.

Author: Sarah Mullarney

Date of report: 17 October 2019

Navigation Committee

31 October 2019

Agenda item number 7

Chief Executive's report and current issues

Report by Chief Executive

Purpose

To brief the Committee on significant matters relating to the maintenance and management of the waterways, and to provide an opportunity for members to raise any such issues.

Contents

1.	Landscapes Review – final report	1
2.	Responding to the climate change emergency	2
3.	Navigation patrolling and performance targets	2
4.	Sunken and abandoned vessel update	2
5.	Planning enforcement update	2
	Appendix 1	4
	Ranger exercise of powers analysis	4
	Appendix 2	6
	Ranger duties: total time allocated and actual days	6
	Appendix 3	8
	Sunken and abandoned vessels - position as at 18 October 2019	8

1. Landscapes Review – final report

- 1.1. The Government has published the final report of the Glover Review of National Parks and AONBs ([Landscapes Review: National Parks and AONBs](#)). The report contains 27 broad proposals, some of which have far-reaching implications. The Broads Authority's members had an initial discussion about the report after their meeting in September and broadly welcomed the contents. We await with interest the Government's view and this may become clearer at a meeting with the Minister and the National Park Chairs and Chief Executives at the end of October.

2. Responding to the climate change emergency

- 2.1. At its meeting on 27 September, the Broads Authority considered a report on how to respond to the climate change emergency. The committee resolved to adopt the Climate Change Emergency Statement for the Broads at Appendix 1 of the report, adding an additional principle (vii).
- 2.2. The principles are that the Broads Authority:
- (i) Recognises a climate emergency and adopts the Statement in Appendix 1 of the report.
 - (ii) Pledges to work towards making the Broads Authority 'carbon neutral' by 2030, with a further objective of reducing all carbon emissions to zero by 2040.
 - (iii) Establishes a baseline for CO² emissions using a common methodology with the National Park Authorities and develops an Action Plan and monitoring system.
 - (iv) Works with its constituent local authorities to reduce emissions from domestic, travel and other sources in the Broads and across the two counties.
 - (v) Works with farmers, land managers, the National Farmers Union and Defra to influence land management practices, to maintain and build organic matter and carbon in soil, to improve biodiversity and store water to protect against flooding and drought.
 - (vi) Works with boating and tourism organisations to continue promoting and developing environmentally friendly boating and sustainable tourism.
 - (vii) Aspires to offsetting carbon emissions locally within the Broads via a Broads offsetting scheme.

3. Navigation patrolling and performance targets

- 3.1. The report of the significant use of powers by Rangers is at Appendix 1 and reflects the busy period. Appendix 2 shows that the average navigation/countryside splits for three months are higher on the navigation side, as would be expected during the summer when patrolling is a priority.

4. Sunken and abandoned vessel update

- 4.1. The sunken and abandoned update is in Appendix 3. We removed a number of vessels on the River Waveney while the dredging kit was in the area.

5. Planning enforcement update

- 5.1. There are no further enforcement matters with navigation implications to report.

Author: John Packman

Date of report: 21 October 2019

[Broads Plan](#) objectives: 3 and 4

Appendix 1 – Ranger exercise of powers analysis

Appendix 2 – Ranger duties: total time allocated and actual days

Appendix 3 – Sunken and abandoned vessels – position as at 18 October 2019

Appendix 1

Ranger exercise of powers analysis

Table 1

Verbal warnings	Wroxham launch Wroxham and upper Bure	Irstead launch Ant	Ludham launch Hickling, Potter Heigham, upper Thurne	Ludham launch 2 Lower Thurne and lower Bure	Norwich launch Norwich and upper Yare	Hardley Launch Reedham, Chet and middle Yare	Burgh St Peter launch Oulton Broad and upper/middle Waveney	Breydon launch Breydon water, lower Waveney and Yare
Care and caution	64	42	23	1	9	0	0	4
Speed	2440	758	598	88	77	113	170	62
Other	57	128	82		14	2	5	1

Table 2

Written warnings	Wroxham launch	Irstead launch	Ludham launch	Ludham launch 2	Norwich launch	Hardley Launch	Burgh St Peter launch	Breydon launch
Care and caution	8	1	1	1	2	0	0	2
Speed	39	9	17	5	2	3	0	4
Other	12	20	8	0	7	20	1	0
Special directions	218	1	120	1	6	65	302	17

Table 3

Launch patrols	Wroxham launch	Irstead launch	Ludham launch	Ludham launch 2	Norwich launch	Hardley Launch	Burgh St Peter launch	Breydon launch
Launch staffed by ranger	192	158	196	105	145	117	135	204
Volunteer patrols	0	5	0	0	0	0	3	0
IRIS reports	37	31	30	28	46	35	30	57

Table 4

Broads Control total calls

Contact method	Number of calls
Telephone	19,654
VHF	5,222
Total	24,876

Appendix 2

Ranger duties: total time allocated and actual days

Table 1

Broads Authority corporate duties

Work area	Annual allocation (days)	Actual days to date
Training	134	51.79
Broads Control	362	203.01
Team meetings, work planning	377	167.31
Partnership working	76	31.05
Assisting other sections	76	36.99
Billets and boatsheds	25	3.01
Launch – general	0	8.72
Trailers - general	0	0.47
Vehicle maintenance	0	2.30
Other equipment repair	0	7.03
Total	1050	830.42

Table 2

Navigation duties

Work area	Annual allocation (days)	Actual days to date
Patrolling	1299	1004.29
Escorts	51	39.46
Prosecution files	0	28.51
Bankside tree management	66	5.81
Obstruction removal	28	8.78
Channel markers and buoys	41	6.49
Signs and boards maintenance	70	12.80
Adjacent waters	107	74.19
Reactive mooring maintenance	121	15.10
Total	1783	1195.44

Table 3

Conservation, recreation, countryside maintenance

Work area	Annual allocation (days)	Actual days to date
Fen management	140	45
Lake, riverbank restoration	90	7.30
Invasive species control	20	4.12
Other conservation work	217	18.92
Pollution response	0	0.41
Visitor site maintenance	214	110.91
Whitlingham Country Park	282	150.34
Public footpath work	14	4.86
Education work	28	14.66
Total	1005	356.51

Team total up to 5 October 2019

Percentage Navigation: 77%

Percentage National Park: 23%

Appendix 3

Sunken and abandoned vessels - position as at 18 October 2019

Description	Location found	Action	Notice affixed	Result
Motor Cruiser	River Yare Old River Thorpe.	Vessel sunk at owner's moorings	No	Not affecting the navigation
Motor Cruiser	Deal Ground, Yare	Vessel sunk	No	Marked with yellow posts. Liaising with owner.
Motor Cruiser	Oulton Broad	Removed	No	Removed
Yacht	Geldeston	BA to raise in liaison with owner	No	Removed
Motor cruiser	Geldeston	As above	No	Removed
Motor Cruiser	Sutton/Stalham cut	Liaising with owner, not in the navigation	No	Monitoring
Motor Cruiser	River Yare Old River, Thorpe	Assistance offered to owner	No	Monitoring, not affecting navigation

Navigation Committee

31 October 2019

Agenda item number 8

Proposed navigation charges for 2020/21 in the navigation area and adjacent waters

Report by Chief Executive, Chief Financial Officer and Head of IT and Collector of Tolls

Purpose

This is the formal consultation with the Navigation Committee on the level of charges for the navigation area and adjacent waters for 2020/21.

The views of the Committee are sought on the following specific matters:

- i. Following contact with the Broads Hire Boat Federation and the one of the larger yards the calculations in the report make the assumption that there will be a reduction of around 10 in the number of hired cruisers with a consequential impact on income for 2020/21 of a loss of £11,500 using the average toll for these craft of £1,150.
- ii. The Tolls Review Group supported additional expenditure of £30,000 for the provision of pontoons to support access from the water at Peto's Marsh and £20,000 for an on-line safety training package for new private boaters and visitors. These will add 1.6% to the level of tolls. Does the Committee support that additional expenditure?
- iii. The Tolls Review Group also supported a differential increase in tolls such that unpowered, electric and hybrid craft have lower increases than diesel or petrol powered craft. The intention of this is to send a signal that the Authority is encouraging a move to electric power, where it is technically feasible.

The report reviews the impact of these issues on charges for 2020/21, presents three options for discussion, and seeks the views of the Committee on charges for next year.

Contents

1.	Introduction	2
2.	Impact of the changes introduced in April 2017	2
3.	Boat numbers and financial position 2019/20	3
4.	Pressures on 2020/21 Navigation expenditure	5
5.	Draft income and expenditure for 2020/21	7
6.	Options for charges for 2020/21	7

1. Introduction

- 1.1. This report examines three issues: The impact of the major changes made to the structure of the Broads Authority's navigation charges in April 2017; trends over the last year in boat numbers and finance; and proposals for charges for 2020/21.

2. Impact of the changes introduced in April 2017

- 2.1. In November 2016, the Authority adopted a series of changes to the calculation of navigation charges to provide for a simpler, fairer and more flexible structure. This decision, which was introduced in April 2017, was prompted in part by the declining number of small private motor boats. Table 1 shows the number of private motor boats by size from 2016-19. It indicates that the increase in small vessels following the structural changes has been maintained, with an extra 151 private motor boats under 11m² this year when compared with 2016.
- 2.2. The Table also shows that there has not been a significant change in the number of larger private motor boats.

Table 1

Number of private motor boats 2016-19

Size m ²	2016	2017	2018	2019	Δ ¹ 2018-19	Δ 2016-19
1-10	1,646	1,820	1,818	1797	-21	151
11-20	1,895	1,893	1,867	1861	-6	-34
21-30	1,604	1,609	1,603	1610	7	6
31-40	870	882	865	875	10	5

¹ change

Size m ²	2016	2017	2018	2019	Δ ¹ 2018-19	Δ 2016-19
41-50	374	370	375	370	-5	-4
51-60	67	63	63	69	6	2
61-70	16	14	18	21	3	5
71-80	2	4	6	6	0	4
81-90	3	3	2	2	0	-1
91-100	2	2	1	0	-1	-2
101-110	1	2	1	1	0	0
Total	6,480	6,662	6,619	6,612	-7	132

3. Boat numbers and financial position 2019/20

- 3.1. In April 2019, charges were increased across the board to maintain existing levels of expenditure and to fund the installation of electric charging points at the Acle Bridge moorings. This work is programmed for this winter.
- 3.2. The total number of all privately-owned boats has not changed significantly this year. While at the end of September there were 21 fewer boats, there has not been a reduction in income because of an increase in the average overall size.
- 3.3. The number and level of income provided by the hired boats continues to fall. As of the end of September, the total number of hired boats was down by 21 (motor cruisers -5). Feedback from the industry is that this trend will continue as they invest in newer larger boats and retire more than they build.
- 3.4. Navigation income in the current year to date is broadly in line with what was budgeted. The total variance has remained as a favourable variance of £80,001 or 4.59% difference from the profiled Latest Available Budget (LAB).

Table 2

Actual navigation income and expenditure by directorate to 31 August 2019

Directorate	Profiled Latest Available Budget £	Actual Income and Expenditure £	Actual Variance £
Income	(3,287,133)	(3,285,273)	-1,860
Operations	1,107,577	1,032,836	+74,740
Strategic Services	123,278	118,257	+5,021
Chief Executive	304,341	274,930	+29,411
Projects, Corporate Items and Contributions from	10,417	37,728	-27,311

Directorate	Profiled Latest Available Budget £	Actual Income and Expenditure £	Actual Variance £
Earmarked Reserves			
Net (Surplus)/Deficit	(1,741,521)	(1,821,523)	+80,001

3.5. The LAB has increased since the September meeting of the Navigation Committee, following budget transfer from the mini-restructure. These movements are set out in Table 3 This increase has been offset by: increased investment income (£8,750), salary savings following the delayed recruitment of the Waterways and Recreation Officer (£13,370), the Solicitor and Monitoring Officer vacancy (£16,972), reduction in Insurance premiums (£5,640) and increasing winter capacity within the Tolls team (£6,675).

Table 3

Adjustments to Navigation LAB

Item	Authorisation reference	Amount £
Original Navigation budget 2019/20 (deficit)	Broads Authority 01/02/19 Agenda item number 12	16,830
Approved carry-forwards from 2018/19	Broads Authority 17/05/19 Agenda item number 12	6,189
Transfer from Strategy and Projects Salaries to Construction and Maintenance Salaries	Broads Authority 27/09/19 Agenda item number 9	3,098
Transfer from Strategy and Project Salaries to Governance Salaries	Broads Authority 27/09/19 Agenda item number 9	8,552
Transfer from Strategy and Projects to Development Management	Broads Authority 27/09/19 Agenda item number 9	(2,380)
LAB as at 31 August 2019	n/a	32,289

3.6. The forecast outturn for 2019/20 is shown in Table 4, being £38,057 less than the LAB.

Table 4

Budget compared to Forecast Outturn for 2019/20

Category	Latest Available Budget 2019/20 £	Forecast Outturn 2019/20 £
Income	(3,440,000)	(3,448,750)
Expenditure	3,472,289	3,442,982
(Surplus) / Deficit	32,289	(5,768)

Category	Latest Available Budget 2019/20 £	Forecast Outturn 2019/20 £
Transfer of accrued interest to earmarked reserves	7,500	11,875
Opening Reserves	(425,985)	(425,985)
Closing Reserves	(386,196)	(419,878)
Reserves as % of Expenditure	11.1%	12.2%

4. Pressures on 2020/21 Navigation expenditure

4.1. On 4 October 2019 the Tolls Review Group considered the level of charges for next year, and reviewed a number of pressures on navigation expenditure including:

- Unknown pay increase for staff as negotiated by the National Joint Council (NJC) for Local Authorities. Trade Unions have opened negotiations asking for 10%, draft budget is currently 2%.
- Uncertainty around pension costs. The draft results of the triennial valuation will not be known until late November/early December.
- Responsibility for moorings and the cost of dredging.

An increase in income of £45,000 (1.3% increase in tolls across the fleet) is required to maintain the existing level of services.

- **On-going reduction in the hire fleet (estimated loss of income at £11,500)**
It is difficult to predict changes in the hire boat fleet. However, the Authority is aware that there will be a further decline next year which has a significant impact on the calculation of next year's charges. The loss of these craft has in the past been partly offset by ex-hire craft entering the private fleet, with a lower contribution to the maintenance of the waterway, and the fact that the newer craft have tended to be larger and pay an increased toll. At this stage it is proposed that an allowance for the loss of 10 hire boats at an average loss of income of £1,150 per vessel is made.

An increase of 1.8% in tolls across the fleet is required to maintain the existing level of services and account for the loss of income.

And the potential for the following additional expenditure:

- **Pontoons to provide access for boats at Peto's Marsh (£30,000)**
The Suffolk Wildlife Trust, supported by the Broads Authority with dredged material from Oulton Broad is landscaping Peto's Marsh and developing through recent acquisition one of the largest nature reserves in the Broads together with a new visitor centre. The provision of pontoons will provide access to a marvellous new site for visitors and private boat owners.

- **Online safety training for boat users (£20,000)**

Development of an on-line tool for boat users but especially hirers to complete an on-line course giving them a basic understanding of some of the key features of boating in the Broads – such as the necessity to wear a life jacket, the importance of taking care when getting on and off a boat, the dangers posed by low bridges and awareness of tidal conditions. It is hoped that this will lead to an increased understanding of the risks involved with boating on the Broads and thereby a lower level of accidents.

- **Sample survey of private boat owners' views (£30,000)**

In January 2015 the Authority had: “supported the ambition to repeat the exercise in five years’ time as part of the strategic approach in formulating its Broads Plan and its priorities, provided finances allowed”. In discussion with Members of the Review Group they supported the funding of the pontoons and the online safety training but felt that the survey was not a priority.

4.2. Following the decision by the Broads Authority to recognise the climate emergency, the Review Group also recommended that electric and hybrid powered vessels, and also unpowered craft, should be given further encouragement through a lower increase in their charges than the rest of the fleet. This proposal is mostly for the purposes of sending a message about the desirability of a switch to electric. There's no realistic prospect of tolls being able to fund a proper network of charging points and it will need significant external funding for the infrastructure to support them. One option might be for the Authority to fund a review of the costs of installing charging points at each of its 24 hour mooring sites to identify those which are economically feasible. The Group recommended that motorised sailing craft with an electric engine should be charged the same as sailing boats to similarly encourage a switch to electric propulsion. This change is included in all three options set out below.

4.3. If the existing standard of service is to be maintained and the £11,500 for the projected loss of 10 hired motor cruisers accounted for then the annual toll income will need to increase from £3,364,000 to £3,463,000, an extra £99,000. (Note: This does not include interest, short visits and other toll income in total navigation income). Taking these pressures and the change to the charges for electric auxiliary yachts into account would require a 3.4% increase across the board.

4.4. In order to facilitate the discussion with the Committee three options are presented.

Option 1

This is based on annual toll income of £3,409,000, a 1.8% increase, required to maintain existing services and taking account of the £11,500 allowed for a reduction of 10 hired cruisers and allowing for the proposed change to electric auxiliary yachts.

Option 2

This adds the costs of the two projects, pontoons at Peto’s Marsh (£30,000) and the on-

line safety training tool (£20,000) to Option 1. (This would require a +3.4% increase across the board).

Option 3

This takes Option 2 and increases the costs for unpowered, hybrid and electric vessels at a lower rate (+1%) than those using diesel and petrol (+3.6%).

5. Draft income and expenditure for 2020/21

5.1. Based on the above proposition, a draft income and expenditure budget for all Navigation Income has been developed for 2020/21 as set out in Table 5 following a zero-based budgeting exercise. We are budgeting for a deficit to maintain reserves close to the recommended 10% figure of expenditure. Options 2 and 3 have the same overall levels of income and expenditure.

Table 5

Draft income and expenditure

Category	Draft Budget 2020/21 Option 1 (£)	Draft Budget 2020/21 Options 2 & 3 (£)
Navigation Income	3,491,600	3,546,600
Expenditure	3,544,147	3,594,147
(Surplus) / Deficit	52,547	47,547
Transfer of interest to earmarked reserves	10,250	10,250
Opening Reserves	419,878	419,878
Closing Reserves	357,081	362,081
Reserves as % of expenditure	10.1%	10.1%

6. Options for charges for 2020/21

6.1. Proposed charges for hire craft and private vessels are set out in Tables 6 and 7. The impact of the increases on the most common size of craft is shown in Table 8.

Table 6

Proposed charges for 2020/21 – Hired craft

No	Category	Current charge	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
1.	Weekly hired motor craft	£30.60 per m ²	£31.15	£31.64	£31.70
2	Weekly hired motor craft – electric and hybrid	£21.46 per m ²	£21.85	£22.19	£21.67
3.	Day hired – petrol/diesel	£46.82 per m ²	£47.66	£48.41	£48.51

No	Category	Current charge	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
4	Day hired Electric	£32.66 per m ²	£33.25	£33.77	£32.99
5.	MCA Passenger Boats and small passenger boats	£40.27 per m ²	£40.99	£41.64	£41.72
6.	Hired Motorised Sailing Craft – diesel	£24.84 per m ²	£25.29	£25.68	£25.73
-	Hired Motorised Sailing – electric Note: Change to same as Hired Sailing	£24.84 per m ²	£18.83	£19.13	£18.69
7.	Hired Sailing Boats	£18.50 per m ²	£18.83	£19.13	£18.69
8.	Hired Houseboats	£15.80 per m ²	£16.08	£16.34	£15.96
9.	Hired Rowing, canoes etc.	£69.44	£70.69	£71.80	£70.13

Table 7

Proposed charges for 2020/21 – Private craft

No	Category	Current charge	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
10.	Private Motor Boats - petrol & diesel	£13.59 per m ²	£13.83	£14.05	£14.08
11.	Private Motor Boats Electric	£10.57 per m ²	£10.76	£10.93	£10.68
12	Private Motorised Sailing Craft - petrol & diesel	£10.05 per m ²	£10.23	£10.39	£10.41
-	Private Motorised Sailing Craft – electric Note: Change to same as Sailing	£10.05 per m ²	£8.61	£8.75	£8.54
13.	Private Sailing Boats	£8.46 per m ²	£8.61	£8.75	£8.54
14.	Private Houseboats	£5.45 per m ²	£5.55	£5.64	£5.50
15.	Private Rowing, canoes etc.	£34.72	£35.34	£35.90	£35.07

Table 8

Impact of proposed charges for typical sized vessels

Vessels	Number of vessels	Current charge	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
12 m ² Day hired boats – petrol/diesel	72	£561.84	£571.92	£580.92	£582.12
38 m ² Weekly hired motor craft	60	£1,162.80	£1,183.70	£1,202.32	£1,204.60
48 m ² Weekly hired motor craft	61	£1,468.80	£1,495.20	£1,518.72	£1,521.60
5 m ² Private sailing craft	504	£42.30	£43.05	£43.75	£42.70
11 m ² Private sailing craft	143	£93.06	£94.71	£96.25	£93.94
5 m ² Private motor boats	721	£67.95	£69.15	£70.25	£70.40
15 m ² Private motor boats	256	£203.85	£207.45	£210.75	£211.20
22 m ² Private motor boats	336	£298.98	£304.26	£309.10	£309.76
38 m ² Private motor boats	108	£516.42	£525.54	£533.90	£535.04

Authors: John Packman, Emma Krelle, Bill Housden

Date of report: 21 October 2019

Background papers: [Tolls review 2016 and proposed navigation charges for 2017/18](#), [Broads Authority minutes 18 November 2016](#)

[Broads Plan](#) objectives: 4.3, 6.2

Navigation Committee

31 October 2019

Agenda item number 9

Construction, maintenance and environment work programme: progress update

Report by Head of Construction, Maintenance and Environment

Purpose

To report progress on Broads Authority activity to maintain the public navigation and develop mooring facilities for public use, and to demonstrate the effective use of available resources.

1. Maintaining water depths for navigation

- 1.1. The detailed breakdown in Appendix 1 gives the volumes for the annual dredging programme to the end of September 2019. A total of 17,210 m³ of dredged sediment has been removed from the prioritised sites, representing 39% of the programmed target of 44,000m³ for 2019/20.
- 1.2. The planned spring and summer dredging on the River Waveney, Oulton Broad and River Bure was completed. Less time was spent dredging on the River Waveney and Oulton Broad, which impacted slightly on planned volumes. Demobilisation from Hickling Broad was later than planned to maximise time on that site, and there was extended movement of equipment and set up time on the Waveney site. The sediment from the River Waveney was all placed on the rear slope of the floodbank on the south (Suffolk) side of the river, and will be available for future floodbank maintenance work.
- 1.3. Dredging project set up has featured heavily this summer in the Construction Team work programme. At Peto's Marsh at Suffolk Wildlife Trust's reserve at Carlton Marshes, the preparation for the habitat creation area that will use 20,000 m³ of sediment is underway. The initial lift of the retaining wall has been constructed and is being allowed to consolidated before more layers are added. At Postwick Tip, our licenced landfill site adjacent to the River Yare, the dried sediment from the past few dredging campaigns on the River Yare has been moved to its final position, as per the site restoration plan. The receiving cell for wet dredgings is ready to accept more sediment in 2020/21. At Waxham Cut, the vegetation on site has been removed ready to start dredging in November.
- 1.4. Mobilisation and site preparation are now underway for this winter's dredge sites at Hickling Broad, Tyler's Cut and Waxham Cut. At Hickling, the Chara Bay reedbed

restoration area had its final engineering assessment, funded through the CANAPE project, prior to infilling the central area with sediment this winter. All forthcoming dredging work is communicated through the [Notice to Mariners](#) page on our website.

- 1.5. The fundamental gauging of water levels and the benchmark level from which target dredge depths are taken from beneath the water surface is being reviewed. Monica Pichler, a PhD student from UEA, has joined the Environment and Design Team on a three-month internship. The aim is to update the modelled 'mean low water' level across the Broads' navigable system using Environment Agency and Broads Authority water level data. From this refreshed analysis and the most recent data, we will be able to see if there are significant variations or improvements that can be made following the exercise last carried out in the mid-1990s.
- 1.6. The draft 2020/2021 dredging programme is in Table 1. Sites on the River Yare in winter 2020/2021 are subject to further planning and agreement.

Table 1

Draft 2020/2021 dredging programme

When	Dredge location	Re-use option
Apr-May	Acle, River Bure	Floodbank setback filling, Oby
Jun-Jul	Fleet Dyke, South Walsham	Floodbank setback filling, Horning
Jun-Sep	Oulton Broad	Peto's Marsh habitat creation scheme
Aug-Sep	Geldeston, River Waveney	Bankside spreading/ floodbank strengthening
Sep-Oct	Trowse, River Wensum	Postwick Tip disposal
Nov	Langley, River Yare	Rockland Short Dyke - bankside spreading/ floodbank strengthening (TBC)
Oct-Mar	Hickling Broad	Chara Bay reedbed creation
Nov-Jan	Waxham Cut	Bankside spreading/ floodbank strengthening
Dec-Mar	Reedham, Lower Yare	Floodbank setback filling, Raveningham (TBC)

2. Maintaining safe public mooring facilities

- 2.1. Ground investigation surveys were carried out at Acle Bridge 24-hour mooring ahead of the planned quay re-piling work this winter. This vital information feeds into the piling and anchoring design specification being drawn up for us by a structural engineer.
- 2.2. Other recent routine maintenance and repairs includes refurbishment of the steps to the Whitlingham Country Park 24-hour mooring, upgrading of safety ladders at Stokesby and Hardley to a new more durable design, and replacement of mooring posts at various locations.

3. Managing riverside trees

- 3.1. We have started our annual winter programme of cutting back tree growth from prioritised areas of the system. Maps of the stretches being managed are shown in the [online mapping](#). The tree shears will be used on stretches along the River Yare from January.

4. Other navigation works

- 4.1. Numerous wrecks have been removed from the system using our floating plant and larger work vessels. Wrecks at Oulton, Commissioners Cut, Geldeston, Rockland and Herringfleet were raised and scrapped.
- 4.2. The continuing marker post replacement programme across Breydon Water saw another 16 posts replaced in September, with broken, missing or weak wooden posts in key locations being replaced by steel posts.

Author: Dan Hoare

Date of report: 10 October 2019

Background papers: [Notice to mariners](#), [Riverside tree and scrub management](#)

[Broads Plan](#) objectives: 2.1, 2.3, 3.1, 3.2, 4.2, 6.1

Appendix 1 – Dredging progress

Appendix 1

Dredging progress

Project title	Active Broads Authority dredging weeks completed/ planned	Planned volume removed m ³	Actual volume removed m ³	Planned annual project cost ¹	Actual project cost
Hickling Broad Dredging of marked channel & habitat creation (Oct - Feb)	0/22	8,000	0	149,670	13,670
Tyler's Cut, Dilham Dilham Staithe and 600m downstream (Nov - Dec)	0/17	3,000	0	40,330	800
Mid-Bure a) South Walsham Fleet Dyke (Apr - May) b) Oby to Acle Bridge (Jun - Aug)	22/22	13,000	10,440	126,640	84,700
Oulton Broad Dredging in North Bay (Aug - Sep)	3/9	6,000	1,200	51,680	16,280
Waxham Cut Dredging & sidecast (Nov - Jan)	0/13	4,000	0	38,090	6,670
Waveney Beccles to Stanley Carrs (Apr - Jul)	10/16	8,000	5,570	102,550	78,360

¹ project costs include staff time for all elements (pre-works ecological mitigation, site set-up, active dredging & site restoration); BA plant; & budgetary expenditure (equipment hire, survey costs, contractor costs, mitigation works, materials & consumables etc); within the reporting period.

Project title	Active Broads Authority dredging weeks completed/ planned	Planned volume removed m³	Actual volume removed m³	Planned annual project cost ¹	Actual project cost
Lower Bure Plough dredge (Mar)	Contractor	2,000	0	10,000	0
Site Restoration Stokesby, Lower Bure & Postwick Tip	-	-	-	43,540	29,460
Site Preparation Peto's Marsh, Carlton Marshes	-	-	-	15,860	11,570
Total	33/99	44,000	17,210	568,360	241,510